

Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee

Report and Recommendations
for Cooperative Consolidation of E-911 Communications
In Broward County, Florida

March 1, 2012

Executive Summary

In 2002, the Broward County voters overwhelmingly voted for the development of a county-wide Enhanced 911 (E-911) communications infrastructure. Through the resulting amendment to the County Charter, the County is now responsible for establishment and maintenance of common public safety radio communications infrastructure. Over the past decade, great strides have been made in supporting radio interoperability and common computer-aided dispatch (CAD) systems, though there is more work to be done.

The overall goals of a consolidation of E-911 communications are to improve service and safety for residents and emergency personnel, establish consistent performance metrics for all residents, eliminate delay in transfer of emergency calls, employ the best technology available to expedite emergency response, and facilitate closest unit response.

Across the United States, there are a number of successful large cooperative consolidations of E-911 communications; each has focused on the goals set forth above. Therefore, the discussion in Broward County of a cooperative consolidation of E-911 communications is not novel.

The current E-911 system in Broward County has 11 dispatch centers (Public Safety Answering Points or “PSAPs) throughout the county. As result, there can be delays in call transfers and potential errors in those call transfers, particularly involving cell-phone initiated 911 calls; such delays are undesirable and can be further minimized through consolidation. There is broad consensus that better and more consistent performance can be achieved through consolidation. There is broad consensus that economies of scale would be generated from consolidation which should result in conservation of taxpayer resources. As true in consolidation models around the United States, the process of cooperative consolidation can be thought of in “Phases”.

Phase I of the process of consolidation included the 2002 voter mandate for County funded common communications infrastructure, the decade long work towards interoperability, and the completion of the initial feasibility study in 2010. Phase I encompassed the process of the stakeholders evaluating the concept of consolidation.

Phase II was the creation of the Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee, a cooperative effort of the Broward County Board of Commissioners and Broward League of Cities. This report from the Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee is the end-step of Phase II.

The creation of the Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee was the result of a decade of work from many groups. In 2011 resolutions adopted by the Public Safety Committee of Broward County League of Cities, The Fire Chief’s Association of Broward County, the Broward County Chiefs of Police Association, The Fire-Rescue Services Council, The Broward County City Managers Association and the Board of

Directors of the Broward League of Cities called for an implementation process for cooperative consolidation of E-911 communications and dispatch.

The BCCCC was populated by city managers, police chiefs, County Sheriff, fire chiefs, two County Commissioners, an emergency medicine expert, as well as Mayors and City Commissioners. The BCCCC gathered data and information from stakeholders and utilized the diversity of experience and viewpoints in deliberation and analysis. There were 20 meetings of the BCCCC and designated Sub-Committees, accounting for over 300 Committee-person hours dedicated to information gathering, analysis and debate.

The BCCCC developed a consensus on principles of governance, operations and funding. In summary, cooperative consolidation must be done in a manner that has all stakeholders involved in the process. Any form of governance must be representative of each municipality and agency involved in the consolidated communications system, with authority over the policy decisions of the consolidated communications structure. The consolidated operations must be within a unified command structure, whether civilianized or otherwise, and following identical standards and metrics for performance. Funding for any consolidated system must be equitable, predictable and stable. The list of consensus points and ideas for the next phase are found at page 23 of this report.

It is important to note that broader technological advances are expected in the coming years. Next Generation 9-1-1 (NG 9-1-1) is the concept recognizing that the current public safety communications systems are not capable of handling text, data, images and video which is becoming increasingly common in personal communications. As a result, there are efforts by the United States Department of Transportation to facilitate such technology and communications nationwide. Minimizing capital, implementation, and upgrade costs, as well as ensuring consistent unified approaches in the region, depend on consolidation of the underlying E-911 communications.

Phase III is the next steps towards consolidation and should include the “sunset” of the BCCCC and development of an Implementation Board. This proposed Board must be funded to provide for expert and professional evaluation of potential sites for dispatch centers, development of procedures and standards to achieve highest possible level of performance, preparation for necessary staffing, development of standard agreements or inter-local agreements, development of proposed budgets and creation of a stable, predictable and equitable funding stream.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Report of Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee5

Phase I: Background on Formation of BCCCC5

Phase II: The Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee.....8

 Governance Sub-Committee.....10

 Operations Sub-Committee.....14

 Funding Sub-Committee.....16

Federation of Public Employees..... 20

Next Generation 9-1-1..... 21

Dispatch Call Processing Time.....22

Phase II: BCCCC Points of Consensus, including PHASE III:
Next Steps for Developing a Regional and Cooperative
Consolidated E-911 Communications System.....23

BCCCC Appendix A

Governance Sub-Committee Appendix B

Operations Sub-Committee Appendix C

Funding Sub-Committee Appendix D

March 1, 2012 Report Of
The Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee

PHASE I: Background on Formation of the BCCCC

In 2002, the voters of Broward County voted overwhelmingly to amend the Broward County Charter to require funding and implementation of E-911 communications infrastructure to facilitate closest unit response. The County Charter now mandates, in Section 5.03(A):

The County Commission with cooperation from Municipalities shall establish a countywide communications infrastructure for fire and emergency medical services. The County shall provide funding for the communications infrastructure and all service providers will utilize the elements of the communications infrastructure. The communications infrastructure shall facilitate closest unit response for life threatening emergencies and support for regional specialty teams.

Over the next 10 years, significant capital investments were made by the County to assist in developing a common communications infrastructure, including common computer aided dispatch systems. Development of radio-interoperability and computer assisted dispatch systems continue to this date. See Appendix ____.

In 2008, there existed 12 “Public Safety Answering Points” (PSAPs), or dispatch centers throughout Broward County.¹ See Appendix _____. At that time, an evaluation of the structural integrity of different dispatch centers revealed that the highest call volume centers were not hardened beyond category 2 hurricane strength. See Appendix _____. As a result, the County began an effort towards developing “flee-to” sites.

“Flee-to” sites were developed to serve as dispatch centers to which other dispatch centers could “flee-to” in times of emergency or inoperability. Through that process of evaluation it was determined that three hardened facilities should be built or outfitted to serve as “flee-to” sites. With Category 5 rating, redundant power and data sources, distance from coastline, space availability, and other technical features, these “flee-to” sites were developed in a coordinated fashion. Two of the “flee-to” sites are complete (Pembroke Pines and Sunrise), with the third expected to be completed in early 2013 (Coconut Creek). The geographical dispersion of these “flee to” sites was also envisioned to roughly divide equally the 911 call volume throughout the County.

In 2010, the Broward County City/County Management Association (BCCMA) Dispatch Committee accepted data and presentations on potential E-911 consolidation issues. A feasibility study was requested and ultimately produced in October 2010. See Appendix _____.

The findings of that feasibility study were:

¹ Since that time, the dispatch center for Deerfield Beach has merged into BSO.

Listed below are the findings that CTD feels the BCCMA should consider if they decide to further pursue the option of developing a more efficient dispatch system for emergency calls,

- A. 9-1-1 Dispatch operations for all Broward County Police, Fire, EMS, Sheriff agencies should be fully consolidated into three PSAPs.** *The following are arguments in support of a three PSAP consolidated configuration:*

Improved Citizen/Officer Safety. *An integrated consolidated dispatch configuration would better facilitate closest unit response to incidents that are independent of agency affiliation. This will minimize response times and increase the overall efficiency of all public safety agencies within the County.*

Minimized 9-1-1 Call Transfers. *All 9-1-1 calls would be answered by one of three common groups of call takers in our proposed consolidated operation, to be direct dispatched from the answering PSAP. This would eliminate most transfers that exist in the current configuration (and their associated potential life threatening delays).*

Cost Savings. *Consolidation could reduce the required quantity of telecommunicator personnel by up to 20 percent as compared to current staffing levels The savings in staff do not include the savings that would be achieved by minimizing management staff (an assessment of current versus required management positions in a consolidated model was not conducted in this phase of the analysis). [...] Consolidating dispatch is also expected to reduce facilities costs (i.e., building maintenance, emergency power equipment, etc.) since an overall reduction in PSAP facilities would be achieved.*

Efficient, cost effective migration to new technologies. *Consolidation also leads to benefits for required future capital outlays for E9-1-1 technology. The inevitable requirement to migrate to Next Generation 9-1-1 technology will be less costly in the consolidated model compared to the cost for the migration of the current 13 PSAPs.²*

- B. Install a Single Management Body for the Consolidated PSAP Model.** *The following are arguments in support of single-body management:*

Policies, salaries, and benefits would be uniform for all call takers, dispatchers, and supervisors.

Single person/department responsible for center performance.

² The BCCMA Report also ‘counts’ Broward County’s Emergency Operations Center (Broward EOC) as a back-up site. With the creation of ‘flee-to’ sites, this report no longer makes that assumption. With the merger of Deerfield Beach operations into BSO, there are currently 11 dispatch communication sites.

A single administrative and support services function serving countywide needs facilitates cost efficiencies by avoiding administrative and support redundancies.

- C. In a three PSAP consolidated configuration, PSAPs should be geographically dispersed. In the event of a PSAP system failure or evacuation, the other two PSAPs in the County can backup call taking/dispatch operations and could serve as flee-to centers.*

This feasibility study was presented in November 2010 to the Broward League of Cities. As a result, it was agreed that a taskforce should be formed to further consider implementation.

It is important to note, even in 2011, there was already a measure of consolidation which has occurred. Presently, BSO dispatches for 24 cities (in whole or in part), representing 66% of the 911 call volume. There has been an integrated and systematic development of “flee-to” sites, which would permit other municipalities to relocate dispatch operations in times of distress or service interruption to the “flee to” sites.³ Additionally, various groups of stakeholders cooperate and coordinate separately on matters related to E-911, including CAD and document systems.

³ However, because there is variability in radio interoperability, CAD systems and document management systems, this process is not a seamless as it would be under a unified and consolidation E-911 communications system.

PHASE II: The Broward County Consolidation Communications Committee

In 2011, The Public Safety Committee of Broward County League of Cities, The Fire Chief's Association of Broward County, the Broward County Chiefs of Police Association, The Fire-Rescue Services Council, The Broward County City Managers Association and the Board of Directors of the Broward League of Cities all overwhelmingly adopted and supported resolutions calling for an implementation process for cooperative consolidation of E-911 communications and dispatch. See Appendix A-__.

The Broward County Consolidated Communications Committee was formed through the cooperation of The Broward County Board of County Commissioners, The Broward League of Cities, The Fire Chief's Association of Broward County, The Broward County Chiefs of Police Association, The Fire-Rescue Services Council, The Broward Sheriff's Office and The Broward County City Managers Association. The membership of the Committee was developed through the cooperation and recommendations of each of those organizations, and then ratified by The Broward County Board of County Commissioners on November 1, 2011. The membership of the full Committee is identified in Appendix A-__.

The BCCCC met on November 10, 2011 and developed sub-committees to address three discrete matters: Governance, Operations and Funding. The membership of each of the sub-committees is identified in Appendix A-__. The BCCCC targeted March 1, 2012 for producing the overall Committee's report. Dates for production of individual sub-committee reports were moved as requested by the individual sub-committees.

The process was designed to be, and has been, inclusive of all stakeholders and viewpoints, including labor union and technical support staff. The Consolidated Communications Committee and Sub-Committee meetings were governed by the rules of open government, with supporting data and documentation available on-line for public review. The Committee/Sub-Committees have collectively held a total of 20 meetings, with over 300 Committee-Person hours of analysis, discussions and deliberation during Committee meetings alone. These hours dedicated do not account for the individual efforts of Committee members reading and analyzing data and information outside of the meetings.

Throughout the process, all meetings were well-attended by not only Committee members, but also staff of the various municipalities and various stakeholders. Input was taken from all wishing to provide data or information, without the formality of requiring input from only Committee members. Additionally, all minutes and information obtained or considered were placed on-line through the cooperation of the Fire Chiefs Association of Broward County: http://www.fcabc.com/Comm_BCCC.php

The goals of a consolidation of E-911 communications are to improve service and safety for residents and emergency personnel, establish consistent performance metrics for all residents, eliminate delay in transfer of emergency calls, employ the best technology available to expedite emergency response, and facilitate closest unit response.

Additionally, there may be an ability to conserve resources by reducing the number of dispatch centers, thus reducing the burdens on taxpayers. Importantly, there is no single standard or oversight for all of the PSAPs throughout Broward County. Unified and consolidation E-911 communications would provide consistent unified standards throughout the county.

Each Sub-Committee prepared a report, which was reviewed and adopted by the Sub-Committee, then submitted to the full BCCCC for review. Changes were made to final reports by consensus of the BCCCC.

A summary of each Sub-Committee Report and findings prepared by the BCCCC is provided below. The full reports, as well as the data and information considered by the Sub-Committees and BCCCC, can be reviewed in the respective appendices.

On February 10, 2012, the Sub-Committees were “sunset” and all further discussions were conducted through the full BCCCC.⁴

⁴ As part of the report process, the BCCCC generated a “Fact Sheet” and “Frequently Asked Questions” summary. It is located at Appendix A-____.

Governance Sub-Committee⁵

The Governance Sub-Committee examined 14 different completed consolidated dispatch models from around the United States. This review categorized the examined models by the following characteristics: Jurisdiction, including major city; Population; Service area; Consolidation date; Number of agencies participating; Dispatch Call Volume; Organization type; Oversight Board composition; and Sub-Committee structure.

The governance structure of these 14 systems can be described as follows: 7 Independent Boards; 3 County Departments; 3 Taxing Authorities; 1 Sheriff Office Department.

There was broad consensus of the Sub-Committee that the most desirable Governance model for public safety communications would be an independent district dedicated to public safety communications. The majority of models of consolidation were structured with independent boards. However, due to legislative impediments preventing establishment of such independent districts in the short term, there was also broad consensus that development of an independent district was so unlikely as not to be given further consideration in the short-term. Long term, this would remain a potential goal.

There was broad consensus that any Governance structure for the Broward County cooperative consolidation effort must include representative presence of all participating agencies/municipalities on a governing board; transparency for reporting of metrics and performance to all agencies/municipalities; hire/ termination authority by the governing board over an executive director, and the establishment of professional committees focused on day-to-day operations

It was agreed there were four basic model types. (1) A consolidated dispatch system run by Broward County Government; (2) A consolidated dispatch system run by the Broward Sheriff's Office with the Governing Board having hire/fire authority over the executive director; (3) A decentralized model of Regional Public Safety Communications Centers with the county divided into four distinct, regionally-based consolidated dispatch entities, each with the same governance and subcommittee structure; (4) Independent district.

After review and analysis, the decentralized model and Independent district were eliminated from further consideration. The Sub-Committee agreed to present to the Full Committee the options of the County and BSO models. The features of each are as follows:

MODEL #1: BROWARD COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF CONSOLIDATED COMMUNICATIONS

- * County Department under the complete control of the County Administrator and the Broward County Board of County Commissioners.

- * County Department is a temporary goal, long-term goal would be an independent taxing district,

⁵ The full and final report of the Governance SubCommittee is located at Appendix B-_____.

- * Interlocal Agreement creating the consolidated dispatch system would be to create an entity as independent from the County as possible.
- * ILA would be approved by all participants in the consolidated dispatch system and would define operations, governance, funding formula, etc.
- * Department governed by a Governing Board comprised of elected officials representing each of the participating jurisdictions.
- * Governing Board would meet quarterly to set policy, and would have the power to confirm the Executive Director, recommend a budget and rates to the County Commission for approval (per the terms of the ILA) and appoint an Executive Committee.
- * The Governing Board would have the power to appoint an Executive Committee made up of several city managers from participating jurisdictions, as well as the County Administrator and Sheriff, or their respective designees.
 - * This Executive Committee would meet monthly and oversee normal operations, including recommending the hiring or termination of the Executive Director, assuring budget oversight and compliance with purchasing requirements, the development of administrative policies and procedure, working with the Executive Director to develop the budget and reviewing performance measures.
- * A final standing subcommittee—the Dispatch Operations Committee—would be made up of public safety professionals and would be tasked with the development of operational policies, protocols and procedures, as well as establish performance standards and deal with technical issues as they arise.⁶
- * All employees of a County-run consolidated dispatch system would be employees of Broward County Government and would report to the Executive Director. In addition to PSAP staff there would be the need for a small staff, and most administrative functions such as HR, purchasing, and legal could be contracted out to a governmental entity able to provide them at the lowest cost available.

MODEL #2: COUNTY-WIDE ILA WITH BSO ACCOUNTABLE FOR COMMUNICATIONS

⁶ It is noted that presently there is currently a Regional Public Safety Communication Committee (RSPSCC) that serves to plan and coordinate use of the current countywide communications infrastructure as contemplated in the Broward County Charter. This existing group has representatives from County, Sheriff's Office and municipal public safety agencies.

- * Dispatch service would be provided by a Department within the Sheriff's Office.
- * Consolidated Dispatch Executive Director would be a BSO employee, subject to the policies and procedures of the organization. However, the Governing Board would have hire/fire authority over the Executive Director.
- * Administrative, legal and other support services provided by BSO.
- * A BSO-run model would be governed by a Board of Directors comprised of an elected official from each participating municipality, two County Commissioners and the Sheriff.
- * Board of Directors would meet regularly to approve general policies related to operations, budget and finance. In addition, the Board of Directors would approve the annual operating and capital budget, as well as the cost allocation formula.
- * Sheriff would not have the power to veto or override decisions that are made by the Board of Directors.
- * An Administrative Manager serving under the Executive Director would be responsible for the preparation of the budget, which after being approved by the Board of Directors would be presented to the County Administrator as a part of the BSO Operation Budget. This budget would subsequently need to be approved by the Broward County Board of County Commissioners as a part of its general operating budget.
- * An Executive Committee made up of City Managers from each participating municipality, the County Administrator and the Sheriff (or his/her respective designee) would be responsible for oversight of operations subject to the policy direction established by the Board of Directors.
- * The Executive Committee would also be able to make recommendations to the Board of Directors for their consideration.
- * A standing Operations Committee made up of Police and Fire/EMS representation from each participating jurisdiction or agency will assist in coordination and preparation of unified procedures and policies and unified radio procedures.
- * In addition, the Operations Committee will serve as a point of contact for each law enforcement or Fire/EMS agency if daily procedural and operations issues arise.

- * Confirmation of this structure would be an ILA executed by all the participating agencies and municipalities.

After consideration of various potential models, voting power of the participating municipalities was recommended, as follows: each participating municipality would have one vote, and actions would require approval from 50 percent of the municipalities representing 75 percent of the population of the County.

The following is the BCCCC summary of the reports and discussions through the Sub-Committees and Committee.

Operations Sub-Committee⁷

The Operations Sub-committee was given the mission of examining operational elements of a potential consolidation of the various E911 and dispatching systems. The Subcommittee established a platform of “establishing a single unified operational approach with cross disciplinary leadership and management”. In addition, 34 overarching goals were adopted as a working document. See Appendix ____.

There was consensus that the following national standards / recommended practices / documents need to be considered when making any final recommendations: CALEA – Commission on Accreditation of Law Enforcement Agencies; CFA – Commission of Florida Law Enforcement Accreditation; NAEMD – National Academy of Emergency Medical Dispatch; NFPA 1221 - National Fire Protection Association’s Standard for the Installation, Maintenance, and Use of Emergency Services Communication Systems; ISO – Insurance Services Office; CAAS – Commission on Accreditation of Ambulance Services; CALAE – PSC – Public Safety Communications Specialty; CFAI – Commission on Fire Accreditation International ; APCO – Association of Public Safety Communication Officials.

A survey was developed with the assistance of PSAP site managers. In all, 34 data elements were evaluated within the major areas of the building itself, the technology systems, and the operations of the centers. The sub-committee had presentations from each of the PSAPs, with the exception of City of Plantation declined to provide any information or participate in the survey process.

The Operations Sub-Committee considered the photographs, floor plans, and presentations made, and reviewed 49 pages of text and graphics. While it would be conceptually and technically possible to relocate all dispatch services to a single site, there were no existing sites in Broward County which could appropriately house all of the dispatch resources necessary. Further, a single site without parallel redundant site was not presently seen as advisable. There was agreement that chosen facilities would need to be in various locations throughout the County. There was also agreement on the need for a single unified CAD system throughout the system.

After further analysis of the facility data, a decision was reached to give the highest priority to the following data elements: year facility built, hurricane rating, flood plain, future capacity, square footage for both existing and expansion, housing for staff during disasters, diversity of power sources, diversity of telephone sources, diversity of data sources, with staff parking for disaster operations as a minor consideration. An additional element of “proximity to the coast” was considered and added as an issue for consideration.

After analyzing the available data, the Subcommittee recommended that the City of Plantation not be considered any further as Plantation opted to provide no information. An additional recommendation was approved to discontinue further consideration for the existing PSAP/911 sites in Fort Lauderdale, BSO/Pompano Beach, and Margate.

⁷ The full and final report of the Operations Sub-Committee is located at Appendix C-____.

The following PSAP/911 sites remain under consideration: BSO – Public Safety Building, Coconut Creek (proposed), Coral Springs, Hollywood, Pembroke Pines, and Sunrise. The consensus of the Operations Subcommittee was the system could be operated with three PSAP/911 centers with geographic diversity.

In 2008, the County began the effort of evaluating the strength and capacities of the PSAPs throughout Broward County. Through that process, the development of “flee-to” sites was initiated. These are sites to which other PSAPs could “flee-to” during periods of compromised operations, whether due to storms or otherwise. These “flee-to” sites were specifically constructed and planned to provide structural integrity during category 5 storms, were located diversely and outside proximity to the coast, had various technical redundancies necessary to provide sustained operations, and had capacity to handle the call volume for the County. Additionally, these “flee to” sites have the capacity to absorb the call volume caused by the loss one of the other three centers. The geographical dispersion of the sites was based also upon roughly dividing equally the county as well as call-volume. Currently, Pembroke Pines and Sunrise “flee to” facilities are complete and operational. The Coconut Creek facility is expected to be complete in early 2013.

While designed to be “flee-to” sites, CTD presented data and analysis that these facilities can appropriately handle the call volume for the entire county and could be the locations for a 3-center cooperative consolidated communications model, upon validation.

However, because the BCCCC was not funded with capacity to retain experts and professionals in the various areas, no specific sites were ultimately selected by the Sub-Committee. It is recommended that final consideration be contingent upon certification by a third party regarding the hurricane rating and other matters important to the establishment of a unified and sustainable consolidated E-911 communications system, there was no recommendation as to which sites should be selected.

Recommendations from the Operations Sub-Committee were:

- The system should use a single CAD system
- The system should use three geographically separate PSAP/911 locations
- The existing locations in Fort Lauderdale, Pompano Beach, and Margate should not be considered based upon the facility assessment
- The existing center in Plantation should not be further considered based upon a lack of information provided
- The platform of establishing a single unified operational approach with cross disciplinary leadership and management should remain in place
- Any final decisions regarding site selection should be contingent upon a third party evaluation of the hurricane rating

Funding Sub-Committee⁸

The Funding Sub-Committee developed a survey in an effort to better define the current operational costs of dispatch county-wide for all residents. Capital infrastructure costs are and are assumed to continue to be the obligation of County government. Those capital infrastructure costs were not the subject of Sub-Committee analysis.

With the assistance of staff, a specific survey was distributed and the responsive information accumulated. The City of Plantation declined to participate in the survey; the City of Margate indicated a willingness to participate but due to the transition of administrations they were unable to provide information. Assumptions based upon historical data were made for these two sites.

Based upon data from all municipalities, and the assumptions for Margate and Plantation, the total direct operational (non-capital) costs for the entirety of E-911 in Broward County was estimated to be \$52,025,834, representing 11 PSAPs with 583 positions for call-taking and E-911 dispatch. This did not include indirect costs often assessed by municipalities for pro-rata share of administrative costs.

Of this portion, \$22.9 million is funded directly by the County. Until this year, an additional \$5.9 million, representing the costs for BSO to dispatch City of Fort Lauderdale, was funded by the County taxpayers through BSO's budget. For 2012, the City of Fort Lauderdale is now funding dispatch in the amount \$5.9 million dollars resulting in a reduction of BSO and/or County funding.⁹

Information was obtained on the statutory revenue generated by cell-phone surcharges pursuant to Florida Statute Section 365.172(9)(b) and (c), commonly referred to as "911 dollars". These "911 dollars" off-set a portion of call-taker salaries and certain capital expenditures for the County and municipalities with PSAPs. While these "911 dollars" are assumed to be available going forward, there is no certainty as to how long those funds would be available.

Under the 3 model consolidated system proposed by CTD and recommended by the Operations Sub-Committee, exclusive of capital costs, it was estimated that operational costs would be \$41.9 million. Using the APCO Retains model for calculating personnel needs, the personnel costs would be expected to be reduced from 583 FTEs to 502 FTEs.

It is estimated there would be non-recurring transitional costs estimated to be \$1.5 million and administrative indirect costs of \$1.9 million going forward.

It is anticipated that a Consolidated Dispatch Model would not only provide the public with a seamless and improved service model, but would result in substantial costs savings

⁸ The full and final report of the Funding Sub-Committee is located at Appendix D-_____.

⁹ The County funds BSO budgetary needs. It was not clear from that budgetary process how much is contributed by the County to fund BSO dispatch services which are unreimbursed by the cities. As a result, information and data was provided by BSO accounting providing the unreimbursed municipal dispatch services handled by BSO but which is paid for by the County.

in both direct employee costs and management/supervision costs. The Proposed Cost Model estimates an operational cost savings in the range of 10.1 million per year. The estimated costs per call would be reduced from \$12 per call to below \$10 per call.

The Subcommittee then identified how the funding sources for current system are achieved (in millions of dollars):

City funding own PSAPs ¹⁰	16.9
City Funding own FIRE PSAP with No Cost BSO police Dispatch ¹¹	0.8
Cities paying for BSO Full Dispatch Services ¹²	7.8
City paying BSO for Fire Dispatch with no cost BSO Police Dispatch ¹³	0.3
 Total City funded Dispatch Services ¹⁴	 25.8
 Aviation Department Paying BSO for Full Dispatch services	 0.8
Cities receiving Full BSO Dispatch Services without charge ¹⁵	
Unreimbursed County Dispatch Cost ¹⁶	18.9
 Total Net Costs (netted for E-911 Revenue)	 45.5
 E-911 Revenue ¹⁷	 6.5
 Total Gross Cost (before E-911 Revenue)	 52.0

The Funding Sub-Committee addressed funding alternatives for a cooperative consolidated communications system: Municipal Services Taxing Unit (MSTU); Fee for Service charge to participating municipalities; Ad Valorem through County

MSTU Approach

This funding source permits the County to collect Ad Valorem taxes from properties in a geographic area less than countywide for a particular municipal type service. The County Commission would approve the MSTU budget and millage rate. Millage levied by a MSTU applies against the ten (10) mill cap of each municipality and unincorporated area.

¹⁰ Coconut Creek, Coral Springs, Hollywood, Margate, Pembroke Pines, Plantation, Sunrise.

¹¹ Miramar.

¹² Ft. Lauderdale, Pompano Beach, Wilton Manors.

¹³ Deerfield Beach.

¹⁴ Funding for city funding achieved through city ad valorem. This is ad valorem above and beyond the ad valorem contributed to the County, which funds dispatch costs.

¹⁵ Cooper City, Dania Beach, Davie, Hallandale Beach, Hillsboro Beach, Lauderdale By The Sea, Lauderdale Lakes, Lauderhill, Lazy Lakes, Lighthouse Point, North Lauderdale, Oakland Park, Parkland, Pembroke Park, Sea Ranch Lakes, Southwest Ranches, Tamarac, Weston, West Park.

¹⁶ Unreimbursed county dispatch costs are funded through county wide ad valorem.

¹⁷ Statutory E-911 dollars are distributed to the PSAPs to off-set a portion of the dispatch operational costs. Reducing these dollars would result in net increase in costs for the PSAPs.

Advantage: Central administration outside the annual budget process of cities; based upon property value data determined by independent official through Property Appraiser;

Disadvantage: Dependent on property values and therefore can fluctuate based upon economic conditions or legislative action aimed at property tax accumulation; not dependent on demands of the system

Fee for Service Approach

This funding source would collect a fee from participating jurisdictions allocated upon an objective and measurable criteria: calls for service, property tax base, population, E-911 phone surcharges, some combination of those and/or additional criteria.

Advantage: Utilizes objective criteria with flexibility based upon changing demands on the system.

Disadvantage: While objective criteria, choosing which criteria may result in widely different results amongst cities; data must be updated constantly or routinely, resulting in unpredictable shifts in funding costs; additional administrative costs potentially

Examples of the potential criteria and allocation percentages is contained at Appendix ___.

Regional Services Approach

This funding source would be defined as a regional service and the County would fund through the collection of Ad Valorem as it does for other regional services. This approach assumes all property owners are required to contribute since they are County residents, will travel throughout the county, and would therefore benefit from the regional approach. The millage would not apply against individual municipalities, though municipalities may wish to reduce their millage to accommodate the shift in tax obligation.

Advantage: Simplifies the funding process to avoid individual municipalities deciding; stability of funding may be achievable through agreements legal mechanisms;

Disadvantage: If unable to protect funds from “across-the-board” cuts from County Commission, may lead to less stability; may result in different governance structure

County Funding Currently and Recent History

Until 2009, the County funding for dispatch, including that which was funded through BSO, totaled approximately \$31,600,000.¹⁸

More recently, through negotiations and expiration of pre-existing agreements, the County no longer funds dispatch costs for the City of Fort Lauderdale and City of

¹⁸ Calculated based upon present dollar estimates as the amount of County-wide dispatch funding through BSO (\$22.9 million), City of Fort Lauderdale (\$5.9 million) and City of Pompano Beach (\$2.8 million).

Pompano Beach. As a result, this has reduced the County and/or BSO financial obligations for dispatch by nearly \$8,700,000 since approximately 2009.

Current County operational support (net of E-911 statutory dollars and capital expenditures) is \$22.9 million dollars. Additional revenue to achieve the estimated \$41.9 million operational costs, less the current \$6.5 million in statutory E-911 dollars, is approximately \$12.6 million dollars in direct costs for the entire county. As a matter of millage, \$12.6 million would represent approximately .1 mills county-wide, assuming the county maintains the current funding level and the statutory E-911 dollars remain constant.

Federation of Public Employees

Just after the creation of the BCCCC and prior to the completion of the Sub-Committees' work, the BCCCC received a letter report from the Federation of Public Employees dated November 29, 2011. See Appendix A-____. While there were a number of concerns raised regarding the staffing levels set forth in the 2010 feasibility study, the report of the FOPE concluded:¹⁹

Broward's coordination of equipment used for emergency response remains incomplete or incompatible and hinders seamless communication throughout each of the individual municipalities. Broward County has made significant progress in incorporating new technology into the 911 system, but other infrastructure vulnerabilities have been unaddressed.

In an effort not to duplicate the same data provided previously we would respectfully direct the Committee to page(s) 2-4, 4-7 of the CTD report for further understanding of the many different technological and radio systems operating in Broward County.

In closing the Federation believes that consolidating the E911 Communications structure of Broward County can be done. We believe that residents and visitors of the county would benefit from such a regionalization of service. We believe that if approached methodically and within State Statute our E911 system could become a model not only for the remainder of our State but for the Nation.

¹⁹ For instance, the FOPE recommended four dispatch sites due to concerns over interruption of service due to technical difficulties and/or storms. Additionally, there were stated concerns related to the modeling of the number FTEs necessary. However, these concerns were offered prior to the development and analysis of the Operations Sub-Committee surveys, the presentations by the PSAPs, the presentations on the "flee-to" sites and discussion by the Operations Sub-Committee and BCCCC. Moreover, the FTEs assumptions were vetted during the Sub-Committee process and there were no further objections or alternative calculations offered by FOPE. In the end, the final actual number of FTEs and the site selection must be further considered in the implementation process during Phase III, which will necessarily include the views of professionals, experts and all stakeholders.

Next Generation 9-1-1

Next Generation 9-1-1 (NG9-1-1) refers to an updating of the nation's 9-1-1 service infrastructure to improve public emergency communications services in an increasingly wireless and mobile society.

In today's 9-1-1 environment, the public can primarily make only emergency voice calls and Teletype calls (by deaf or hearing impaired persons). Only minimal data is delivered with these calls, such as Automatic Number Identification, subscriber name and Automatic Location Identification, when available.

In the Next Generation 9-1-1 environment, the public will be able to make voice, text, or video emergency "calls" from any communications device via Internet Protocol-based networks. The PSAP of the future will also be able to receive data from personal safety devices such as a vehicle Advanced Automatic Collision Notification systems, medical alert systems, and sensors of various types. The new infrastructure envisioned by the NG9-1-1 project will support "long distance" 9-1-1 services, as well as transfer of emergency calls to other PSAPs—including any accompanying data. In addition, the PSAP will be able to issue emergency alerts to wireless devices in an area via voice or text message, and to highway alert systems.

The need for this NG9-1-1 infrastructure, first identified in 2000, is intended to replace current 9-1-1 services over time. Development actions started in 2003, and are continuing with the development of a full definition and standards for NG9-1-1. Since 2006, the US Department of Transportation (DOT)²⁰ has been leading their NG9-1-1 Initiative, a research and development project aimed at advancing NG9-1-1.

Public safety communications groups and experts recognized that the nation's current 9-1-1 system was not capable of handling the text, data, images and video that are increasingly common in personal communications. The stated goal of the USDOT project is to: "To enable the general public to make a 9-1-1 "call" (any real-time communication – voice, text, or video) from any wired, wireless, or IP-based device, and allow the emergency services community to take advantage of advanced call delivery and other functions through new internetworking technologies based on open standards." The project is aimed at ultimately establishing a national architecture for an NG9-1-1 system that would meet these goals, and to create a transition plan for NG9-1-1.

While not yet fully developed, the increasing complexity of NG9-1-1 support the need for a regional approach to public safety dispatch services. The traditional model of each community replicating infrastructure to meet only its on geographic needs fail to recognize the community's citizens are increasingly mobile – requiring a much more technologically advanced approach.

²⁰ See <http://www.its.dot.gov/ng911/> for further information.

PLACEHOLDER FOR DISPATCH CALL PROCESSING TIME SECTION

PHASE II: BCCCC Points of Consensus

Governance

Must include a Governing Board with full representation of participating agencies;

Each participating municipality/agency must have a seat on the Governing Board;

Under any Governance model chosen, each participating municipality would have one vote, and actions would require approval from 50 percent of the municipalities representing 75 percent of the population of the County;

Governing Board must have hire/termination authority over Executive Director;

Development of Independent District would be most desirable, but due to predicted legislative impediments to development of an independent district, this was not considered further by the BCCCC;

The BCCCC recommends further consideration of two potential models for governance and operations: (a) a regional model where the Board of Directors would have hire/fire authority over the Executive Director through the Broward Sheriff operations; or (b) a similar model operated through Broward County department.

If BSO model, the Sheriff can not have veto power over decisions of the Governing Board;

Whichever model is chosen, a professional Executive Committee, Operations Committee, and potentially additional specialized committees are necessary;

Development of uniform and standard inter-local agreements, if required under the model chosen, rather than individual municipalities negotiating separate deals;

ILA must provide stability of governance;

It must be recognized that because this is should be a cooperative process for consolidation, there may be agencies/municipalities who choose not to participate initially. However, the structure, including operations, must allow for the potential migration into the consolidated system.

Operations

Consolidation of E-911 communications and dispatch services is technically feasible, desirable and will improve service;

Will reduce delay in the transfer of emergency calls;

Will result in faster overall emergency response times;

Will enhance interoperability and coordination amongst responding agencies;

Will result in fewer errors due to standardized call handling and dispatch protocols;

A single, common CAD is required and recommended;

It is technically feasible and recommended to reduce the number of PSAPs to 3 for the entire County;

A consolidated communications system should use three geographically separate PSAP/911 locations;

It is necessary before site selection to have professional expert and validated opinions on viability and desirability of chosen infrastructure;

Metrics for performance should be based on 'best practices' and exceed national standards, if possible;

The existing locations in Fort Lauderdale, Pompano Beach, and Margate should not be considered based upon the facility assessment;

The existing center in the City of Plantation should not be further considered based upon a lack of information provided;

The platform of establishing a single unified operational approach with cross disciplinary leadership and management should remain in place

The chosen model must have a professional, unified structure with accountability based upon performance metrics;

ILA must provide stability and transparency of operations;

Funding

Funding must be equitable, stable and predictable;

Funding must take into account this is a regional function;

ILA must provide stability, predictability, transparency and equity of funding;-

The BCCCC recommends further consideration of three potential funding options: (a) Municipal Services Taxing Unit, (MSTU) millage set by Broward County Commission and dedicated to communications only; (b) Service

agreement predicated upon usage, population, taxable value, or some combination of those three; (3) County funding through Ad Valorem.

PHASE III: Next Steps for Developing a Regional and Cooperative Consolidated E-911 Communications System

1. Sunset the Broward County Consolidation Communications Committee.

Because the Committee has achieved as much as could be developed without professional evaluation of structures and sites, development of expert transition teams, legal assistance in the development of ILAs/agreements, the BCCCC should be terminated or “sunset.”

2. Establish the “Broward County Consolidated Communications Implementation Board”

The BCCCIB could be formed through the development of a standard Memorandum of Understanding (“MOU”) for rights and obligations of participating municipalities during the implementation process, without a commitment to participate in the final work product until the development of final inter-local agreements.

The new group, BCCCIB, would be responsible to:

Governance

Draft a Charter, Operating Bylaws and an acceptable “inter-local” agreement (for the County and participating municipalities) for the final entity – potentially known as Broward Regional Communications System (BRCS);

Recommend best practices for selection of Governing Board members;

Define, assess and rank the alternative governance structures from the final BCCCC report.

Funding

Define, assess and rank funding alternatives from the BCCCC final report;

For the top funding alternatives:

Determine budget impact on municipalities, Broward County and BSO;

Tax burden on residents within Broward County;

Determine timeline for implementation of the top two ranked alternatives – anticipate initial needs to occur in the FY 2012/2013;

Operations

Determine the administrative and technical requirements for implementation of BRCS. Contrast how these differ from the anticipated ongoing operation needs;

Establish standards and metrics which achieve the highest level of performance and service;

Evaluate and rank proposed 9-1-1 center locations;

Review must include engineering and technical analysis of the buildings and infrastructure needs, with any deficits & mitigation costs clearly defined.

To the degree specific resources are needed, actively participate with Broward County/BSO in the selection of key contractors/personnel needed for implementation.

The Broward County Consolidated Communications Implementation Board shall anticipate the following timeframes and external reviews:

BCCCIB's time horizon exists from approval of the Broward County Commission for implementation activities until Sept 30, 2013;

Funding for initial 'seed' activities must be identified in time for inclusion within the County's FY2012/2013 budget;

If an MSTU is the appropriate funding mechanism, drafting of ordinance and ILAs related to participation must be completed in order to allow creation of the MSTU for the FY2013/2014 budget;

Full implementation for regional communications could begin Oct 2013 – some phasing is anticipated during the first year – subject to adoption by individual agencies and municipalities and the County.